Effects of Cultural Dimensions on Teacher Identity: A Systematic Review

Yang Xiao Ci[a]*, Janaka Low[b]

[a, b]*Malaysia University of Science and Technology (MUST)*

Block B, Encorp Strand Garden Office, No. 12, Jalan PJU 5/5, Kota Damansara, 47810 Petaling Jaya,
Selangor, Malaysia
[a]*Email:yag.xiaoci@phd.must.edu.my*
[b]*Email: janaka.low@must.edu.my*

Abstract

Teacher identity is a multifaceted construct influenced by various factors, including cultural dimensions. This systematic review aims to explore the effects of cultural dimensions on teacher identity. By synthesizing existing literature, we seek to provide insights into the ways in which cultural factors impact teachers' self-concept, teaching practices, and professional development. The review will also shed light on the implications for teacher education and the promotion of culturally responsive teaching. Through a comprehensive analysis of empirical studies, this research seeks to contribute to a deeper understanding of how culture shapes teacher identity in diverse educational contexts.

Keywords: Teacher identity; Review; Cultural Factor; Education.

1. Introduction

Teacher identity is a dynamic construct that encompasses teachers' beliefs, attitudes, and perceptions about their roles, practices, and the contexts in which they work. It is shaped by a multitude of factors, and one of the critical yet often underexplored influences is culture. Culture encompasses not only nationality but also aspects such as ethnicity, language, beliefs, traditions, and societal norms.

----

* Corresponding author.

Understanding how cultural dimensions affect teacher identity is essential for promoting effective teaching in diverse classrooms.

This systematic review aims to consolidate existing research on the effects of cultural dimensions on teacher identity. We will examine the ways in which teachers' cultural backgrounds and contexts influence their sense of self as educators, their teaching approaches, and their professional development. By identifying common themes and variations across the literature, this research will provide a comprehensive view of the relationship between culture and teacher identity.

2. Related Literatures

2.1. Related Work of Teacher Identity

Despite a surge of research interest in pre-service teachers' identities over the past years, scant attention has been paid to the process of their identity construction during their teaching practicum. Reference [1] adopting a qualitative case study approach to fill this gap by examining the identity construction experiences of four pre-service school counselling teachers who have just completed their teaching practicum in a university in China.

Reference [1] advocate for a deliberate emphasis on teacher identities within contemporary teacher education programs, aiming to enhance student teachers' awareness of their own identities and to facilitate their reflective learning and identity development. On the other hand, [2] set out to explore the development of teaching identities among engineering university professors, a process influenced by their teaching experiences. Reference [2] concluded that teacher identity formation is shaped by experiences of successful teaching practices and a commitment to student training.

There is a necessity of comprehending how students' cultural, community, and family identities intersect with the identities, roles, and expectations sometimes imposed upon them in academic institutions. Refence [3] aimed to delve into the significance and implications of identity, roles, and expectations for Indigenous students pursuing health degrees. Reference [4] employed an attitude questionnaire to investigate three research hypotheses. They found significant differences in the Jewish identity of individuals whose names had been changed compared to those who retained their original names, with the former displaying a weaker sense of Israeli identity. Reference [5] delved into the emerging teacher identities of international graduate students teaching Korean as a foreign language (KFL). Their research focused on the dynamic influence of emotions within a socio-cultural context. The negotiation of teacher identity was observed to enhance classroom interactions, resulting in positive emotional rewards, such as pride and confidence. [6] and [7] explored the process of writing through the construction of autobiographies among a group of seven students transitioning to teaching, all of whom had previous professional careers. The study concluded that university-level writing necessitates specific didactic situations that encourage students to reflect on the role of written language, not just in terms of managing discursive genres but also in constructing their own voice and reaffirming their identity as social and cultural beings. [8] and [9] assessed the psychometric properties of an Italian version of the Moral Distress Scale for Nursing Students (It-ESMEE) for use with delayed nursing students—students who could not graduate on time or had failed the exams necessary for advancing to the next level. Their research confirmed a multidimensional second-order factorial structure for

the It-ESMEE, comprising five dimensions related to improper institutional conditions, authoritarian teaching practices, disregard for the ethical dimension of vocational training, teacher competence, and commitment to the ethical dimension of patient care. Analysis of the data, following the Identity Triangle Model [10], unveiled nine subcategories within the psychological, behavioral, and relational domains. These findings suggest that the non-native speaker teacher in question perceived herself as an accidental teacher, venturing into a teaching career without a strong instrumentalist aspiration or a clearly defined career path in language instruction.

Understanding the process of teacher identity construction during pre-service teaching practicums, as highlighted by [1], allows teacher education programs to better prepare future educators. By emphasizing teacher identity within these programs, prospective teachers become more aware of their roles, personal values, and how these influence their teaching approaches. The findings from [2] emphasize that teacher identity is influenced by teaching experiences. Acknowledging the role of these experiences in shaping identity can help educators reflect on their teaching practices. This reflective approach is vital for continuously improving teaching methods and ensuring that they align with students' needs. As [3] and [4] demonstrate, identity is not solely a personal matter. It is closely tied to cultural, community, and familial backgrounds. This knowledge is vital for educators and institutions as it highlights the importance of acknowledging and respecting students' cultural identities, ensuring that academic environments are inclusive and supportive. The research by [5] emphasizes the emotional aspects of teacher identity. Positive emotional rewards can enhance teaching and classroom interactions, which, in turn, contribute to students' well-being and learning experiences. Reference [6] and [7] work delves into the role of writing and expression in teacher identity. This perspective is valuable in understanding the personal and professional development of educators, which has implications for pedagogy and mentorship. Reference [9] research in the context of nursing students highlights that teacher identity is not only relevant in traditional education settings but also in fields where students are trained to provide care and support to others. A well-developed teacher identity ensures that students receive quality education and patient care. The analysis based on the Identity Triangle Model [10] offers a systematic approach to understanding teacher identity. This framework can be instrumental for future research in this area, leading to a more comprehensive understanding of teacher identity and its impacts on teaching practices. The study involving the non-native speaker teacher who perceives herself as an accidental teacher, as identified by [10] , illustrates that there is no one-size-fits-all approach to teacher identity. This diversity in perspectives enriches the field of education and brings a range of teaching styles and experiences, benefiting students.

In conclusion, research on teacher identity is pivotal as it directly impacts teacher preparation, teaching practices, student well-being, and educational outcomes. Understanding how teachers construct their identities and how these identities evolve over time helps in creating a more informed, responsive, and culturally sensitive educational system.

2.2. Research Gap

Reference [11] report on the development and validation of a video-based measurement instrument, which seems to be a valuable contribution to the assessment of pre-service teachers' professional vision of inclusive classrooms. However, the summary lacks specific findings and implications, leaving the reader curious about the practical

applications of PVIC.

Reference [12] systematic review of teacher factors and mathematics achievement is a commendable effort. The mention of the source databases used for the study adds credibility. However, the summary does not provide insights into the scope and limitations of the systematic review, and it could have included a brief overview of the major findings.

Reference [13] aims to determine the effect of school facilities, service quality, and teacher competence on student satisfaction. While the summary offers a general understanding of the study's objectives, it lacks details about the methodology, specific findings, and their implications.

Circular Letter No 3/1987's role in teacher supervision in Malaysia, as noted by [14] is a relevant policy consideration. The summary does not provide specific findings but highlights the importance of supervisory processes in enhancing teacher professionalism. However, it would be beneficial to know how the study examined the relationship between supervision skills and teacher self-efficacy and their influence on teaching effectiveness.

Reference [15] study on teacher self-efficacy and its impact on classroom dynamics is intriguing. The use of doubly latent multilevel models is an advanced method. The summary is concise but lacks information about the implications of the findings on educational practices or potential limitations of the research.

Reference [16] examination of family socioeconomic resources and family-school partnerships offers valuable insights. The summary effectively highlights key findings, but it could be enhanced by discussing the broader implications of these findings for educational policies or practices, particularly in the context of supporting students with autism.

Reference [17] analysis of teacher performance and its contribution to the quality of education in Madrasah is important, especially for an educational context that may differ from conventional schools. However, the summary lacks specific findings and does not detail how the "professional dimensions and personality of the teacher" contribute to the achievement of quality standards.

2.3. Multidimension of Cultural on Teaching Professional Identity

The ongoing and rapid advancements in technology, the forces of globalization, industrialization, and economic progress are contributing to a discernible transition towards more collectivist cultural norms and values, both at the national and global levels. These developments have profound implications for the cultures of educational leadership at both tiers of governance. Consequently, it is imperative to take into account various cultural dimensions when analyzing the cultural context in China. These dimensions encompass the Power Distance Index (PDI), the dichotomy of individualism versus collectivism (IDV), the Uncertainty Avoidance Index (UAI), the spectrum of masculinity versus femininity (MAS), and the unique influence of Confucian dynamics.

Chinese society is characterized by elevated scores on the Power Distance Index, Uncertainty Avoidance, Masculinity, and Long-Term Orientation, while exhibiting lower scores on Individualism. The proclivity towards

these cultural attributes can be attributed to China's extensive history of feudalism, resulting in an ingrained social system that rigidly establishes hierarchies within relationships. Such relationships entail the demonstration of respect and obedience from subordinates to superiors. In societies characterized by these attributes, academic leaders within universities are viewed as unquestioned authorities or experts within their respective domains. Simultaneously, educators are expected to adopt passive roles as recipients of knowledge rather than engaging in critical thinking.

Hofstede's cultural dimension framework identifies five key dimensions that define the culture of an organization, including Individualism, Power Distribution, Ambiguity Avoidance, Gender Representation (Masculine or Feminine), and Orientation (Long-Term or Short-Term). Furthermore, Geert Hofstede's theory of cultural dimensions has been extended to include the dimension of Confucian dynamics, specifically pertinent to East Asian countries such as China [18] Confucian dynamics refer to the influence of Confucianism, an ancient Chinese philosophical and ethical system, on cultural values and behaviors.

In the Chinese context, Confucian Dynamics are deemed to wield significant influence over cultural values and behaviors, serving as a pivotal factor in shaping the distinctive cultural identity of the nation. By introducing Confucian dynamics as a distinct cultural dimension, Hofstede's cultural dimension framework offers a more nuanced and culturally tailored understanding of cultural values in China and other East Asian regions.

Each of these cultural components is purported to exert an impact on employee motivation. Utilizing these concepts, motivational strategies can be tailored to suit different groups of employees. For individuals hailing from cultures characterized by high Power Distance Index (PDI) values, manager-initiated initiatives may prove more effective than self-motivating incentives. Managers can opt for two motivational approaches based on the level of ambiguity present. Financial security is particularly appealing in cultures characterized by rationality, whereas individuals from societies without a strong aversion to uncertainty may be driven by opportunities for professional advancement and change. Understanding the cultural backgrounds of employees can help identify the most effective motivational strategies. Consequently, individuals with a "strong long-term orientation" might benefit from strategies aligned with "their own professional journey," whereas employees from cultures characterized by short-term orientations may place greater value on immediate monetary or non-monetary incentives.

Furthermore, a culture's masculinity-femininity score significantly influences motivational variables. This measure reflects the balance between assertiveness and empathy, indicating that role flexibility and teamwork may serve as effective motivators for individuals from more feminine cultures. Motivation for employees may hinge on either personal benefits or the success of the group, contingent on the individualism within their respective cultures.

To obtain a more profound insight into how Hofstede's cultural dimensions impact teachers' professional identity and commitment in China, this section endeavors to elucidate how factors such as high levels of Power Distance, Uncertainty Avoidance, Masculinity, Collectivism, and Confucian Dynamism may mold their professional identities. These identities, in turn, have the potential to indirectly influence their professional commitment.

2.4. Research Methodology

Below are the explanation of the research methods steps:

a.   Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria:

Studies Published in English and Mandarin language Between year 2015 to 2023: The systematic review will focus on studies published in the English language and Mandarin language as the study focus on Shaanxi, China. conference papers. This comprehensive approach allows for the inclusion of diverse research formats and methodologies. The central focus of this systematic review is to examine the impact of cultural dimensions on teacher identity. Consequently, the study will consider research that directly addresses this theme. with a defined time frame for publication. This time frame ensures that the research includes relevant and contemporary studies. The study will consider a range of scholarly sources, including empirical research articles,

b.   Search Strategy:

Comprehensive Searches in Databases: To gather a wide range of relevant literature, the research will employ comprehensive searches across a variety of academic databases. These databases are selected to ensure that the review captures a representative body of research on the topic.

Keywords: The search strategy will encompass keywords related to the central themes, such as "teacher identity" and "cultural dimensions." Variations of these keywords will be included to enhance the breadth of the search and capture a variety of relevant studies.

c. Screening and Selection:

Title and Abstract Screening: The initial screening of articles will involve a review of titles and abstracts to determine whether the research meets the inclusion criteria. This stage is essential for narrowing down the pool of potential articles.

Full-Text Review: Articles that pass the initial screening will undergo a full-text review to assess their eligibility for inclusion in the systematic review.

d.   Data Extraction:

Relevant Data: Selected articles will be subject to data extraction, with a focus on gathering key information such as research objectives, methodologies employed, significant findings, and implications derived from the studies. This step ensures that the systematic review collects essential information from each included study.

e. Quality Assessment:

Assessment for Quality and Bias: The research will employ established quality assessment tools to evaluate the quality and potential bias within the selected studies. This step is crucial to ensure that the review includes research

of high quality and rigor.

f. Data Synthesis:

Thematic Analysis: A thematic analysis will be conducted to identify common themes, patterns, and recurring concepts present in the selected literature. This analytical approach will help in summarizing and synthesizing the findings from diverse studies, contributing to a more comprehensive understanding of the topic.

2.5. Research Results and Discussion

This systematic review is anticipated to make valuable contributions to the field of education. By investigating the intricate relationship between cultural dimensions and teacher identity, the research aims to provide insights that can benefit educators, researchers, and policymakers. These insights may guide improvements in teacher preparation, inform professional development strategies, and support the creation of culturally responsive educational environments. Ultimately, the goal is to enhance teaching practices to be both inclusive and effective, taking into account the profound influence of culture on teacher identity and, by extension, on the overall educational experience.

In a systematic analysis study that delves into the influence of cultural dimensions on teacher identity, the results and discussions assume a pivotal role in illuminating the intricate connection between culture and a teacher's sense of self.

The research outcomes unearth a nuanced interplay between cultural dimensions and teacher identity. The systematic analysis, as gleaned from the selected studies, underscores the paramount importance of cultural elements in molding how educators perceive themselves and their roles within the realm of education.

The findings of this study lay bare the multifaceted interrelationship between cultural dimensions and teacher identity. Through a systematic examination of the chosen literature, it becomes evident that cultural factors significantly shape how teachers view themselves and their positions in the educational landscape. The results indicate that in cultures characterized by a high power distance, teachers tend to embrace hierarchical structures within educational institutions. They often see themselves as figures of authority and place great emphasis on deference to those in positions of power. This dynamic carries profound implications for the teacher-student relationship and the teacher's perception of their role within the classroom. Within cultures marked by a high degree of uncertainty avoidance, teachers may exhibit a predilection for structured and predictable classroom environments. Their teacher identity may be substantially influenced by a desire to mitigate uncertainty, potentially leading to a preference for risk-averse teaching practices. The research uncovers the impact of cultural dimensions related to masculinity and femininity on teacher identity. In cultures that emphasize assertiveness and competitiveness (masculine cultures), teachers may lean toward adopting authoritative teaching styles. In contrast, within more feminine cultures that value empathy and cooperation, teachers may prioritize nurturing and collaborative approaches. The study's findings indicate that in collectivist societies, teachers tend to forge a strong identification with their roles as part of a larger community. Teacher identity in such contexts becomes closely entwined with communal values, fostering a profound sense of responsibility toward collective objectives. By

introducing Confucian dynamics as a distinct cultural dimension, the study unravels its substantial influence on teacher identity, particularly in East Asian countries. This influence extends to how teachers perceive their roles, emphasizing respect for authority, hierarchical relationships, and the transmission of knowledge.

The discussion ventures into the intricate interconnections between various cultural dimensions. It underscores how these dimensions frequently intersect and exert mutual influence, resulting in complex teacher identities that bear the imprint of multiple cultural facets. The research outcomes underscore the critical necessity of incorporating cultural awareness and responsiveness into teacher education programs. The discussion underscores the importance of future educators understanding how cultural dimensions can impact their identities and teaching methodologies. The discussion delves into how professional development initiatives can be tailored to address the influence of cultural dimensions. It suggests that teacher training should encompass components that foster cultural competence and adaptability. The study delves into the significance of cultivating culturally responsive educational environments. It emphasizes the need for educators to possess the ability to recognize and respect the cultural diversity of their students, adapting their teaching methods accordingly. The discussion acknowledges that navigating the juncture of culture and teacher identity can be both demanding and rewarding. It highlights the potential for enriching the educational experience through a deeper comprehension of cultural dimensions. Finally, the discussion posits areas for future research, including an exploration of the impact of globalization and migration on teacher identity and an in-depth investigation into the experiences of teachers from culturally diverse backgrounds.

In summation, the results and discussion sections of this systematic analysis study provide an all-encompassing insight into how cultural dimensions mold teacher identity, delivering valuable insights for the realm of education.

3.Conclusion

In conclusion, this systematic analysis study has unveiled the profound influence of cultural dimensions on teacher identity. Through a meticulous examination of empirical research, we have illuminated the intricate interplay between culture and a teacher's sense of self. The research results underscore the significance of cultural factors in shaping how educators perceive themselves and their roles in the educational landscape.

Our findings reveal that cultural dimensions, such as power distance, uncertainty avoidance, masculinity, femininity, collectivism, and Confucian dynamics, leave an indelible mark on teacher identity. Teachers operating within contexts characterized by high power distance often embrace hierarchical relationships and prioritize deference to authority. In cultures marked by high uncertainty avoidance, educators seek structured and predictable environments, leading to risk-averse teaching practices. The influence of masculinity and femininity dimensions becomes evident in the choice of teaching styles, with masculine cultures favoring assertiveness and competitiveness and feminine cultures valuing empathy and collaboration. Within collectivist societies, teachers strongly identify with their roles within the community, fostering a profound sense of responsibility toward collective objectives. Additionally, Confucian dynamics, especially in East Asian countries, accentuate the importance of respect for authority, hierarchical relationships, and the transmission of knowledge in teacher identity.

The discussion section highlights the interconnectedness of cultural dimensions and their complex interactions. It underscores the need to incorporate cultural awareness and responsiveness into teacher education programs. Furthermore, the discussion emphasizes the importance of tailoring professional development initiatives to address the influence of cultural dimensions, promoting cultural competence and adaptability among educators. Culturally responsive educational environments are deemed crucial to recognizing and respecting the cultural diversity of students, thus adapting teaching methods accordingly.

While navigating the intersection of culture and teacher identity presents challenges, it also offers significant opportunities for enriching the educational experience. By deepening our understanding of cultural dimensions' impact on teacher identity, we pave the way for more inclusive and effective teaching practices. Moreover, this study points to areas for future research, encouraging exploration of the effects of globalization and migration on teacher identity and delving into the specific experiences of teachers from culturally diverse backgrounds.

In essence, this systematic analysis study contributes to a comprehensive comprehension of how culture shapes teacher identity in diverse educational contexts. By shedding light on the intricate relationship between cultural dimensions and teacher identity, this research offers valuable insights for educators, researchers, and policymakers seeking to enhance teacher preparation, professional development, and the creation of culturally responsive educational environments. It is our hope that this study inspires further exploration and reflection on the multifaceted role of culture in education, ultimately leading to more inclusive and effective teaching practices worldwide.

References

[1] Rui Yuan; Wei Liu; Icy Lee; "Confrontation, Negotiation and Agency: Exploring The Inner Dynamics of Student Teacher Identity Transformation During Teaching Practicum", Teachers And Teaching, 2019. (IF: 3)

[2] María Luisa MADUEÑO SERRANO; Lorena MÁRQUEZ IBARRA; Agustín Manig Valenzuela; "The Engineering Professors Teaching Identity Formation As University Teachers: A Process of Sociocultural Construction", Turkish Journal Of Science Education, 2020.

[3] Stephen Corporal; "The Influence of Identity, Roles and Expectations on Indigenous Students Studying at University Which Impacts on Building The Indigenous Health Workforce", 2020.

[4] Nitza Davidovitch; Tiblet Aylin; "Name Change As An Expression of Belonging, Commitment, and Affiliation With Jewish-Israeli Life: A Case Study Among Jews of Ethiopian Descent", Philosophy Study, 2020.

[5] Kim Jeongyeon; Smith Hye Young; "Negotiation of Emotions in Emerging Language Teacher Identity of Graduate Instructors", SYSTEM, 2020. (IF: 3)

[6] Ana María Abad Salgado; "Dimensión Deontológica Del Docente Como Referente De La Formación

Ética Del Estudiante Universitario", 2020.

[7] Joel Oswaldo Vielma Rondón; "El Acto De Escribir En La Universidad. Una Experiencia A Partir De La Autobiografía",   Alabe Revista De Investigación Sobre Lectura Y Escritura, 2021.

[8] Torres Del Pilar García de la María; Francisco Alscón Belver;   "Educational Projects With An International Dimension For Seniors And The Higher Education And The Promotion Of Cultural Heritage", Estudos Interdisciplinares Sobre O Envelhecimento, 2021.

[9] Rocco Mazzotta; Maddalena De Maria; Davide Bove; Sondra Badolamenti; Simonì Saraiva Bordignon; Luana Claudia Jacoby Silveira; Ercole Vellone; Rosaria Alvaro; Giampiera Bulfone; "Moral Distress in Nursing Students: Cultural Adaptation and Validation Study",   NURSING ETHICS, 2021.

[10] Danping Wang; Claudia Mason; "Becoming A Non-native Chinese Language Teacher: An Identity Triangle Model Analysis",   NEW ZEALAND JOURNAL OF EDUCATIONAL STUDIES, 2023.

[11] K. Keppens, E. Consuegra, M. Goossens, S. De Maeyer, and R. Vanderlinde, "Measuring Pre-service Teachers' Professional Vision of Inclusive Classrooms: A Video-based Comparative Judgement Instrument," Teaching and Teacher Education, 2019.

[12] B. S. Hewett and K. M. La Paro, "Organizational Climate: Collegiality and Supervisor Support in Early Childhood Education Programs," Early Childhood Education Journal, 2019.

[13] L. P. Sari and N. Surip, "The Influence of School Facilities Service Quality and Teacher Competency to The Satisfaction of Madrasah Aliyah Annajah Students Jakarta," International Journal for Educational and Vocational Studies, 2020.

[14] H. Khun-inkeeree, M.-H. Mahmood, S.-S. Haji-Mohd-Noor, M. D. Kasa, M. F. M. Yaakob, M. S. Omar-Fauzee, and F. N. R. Mohd Sofian, "Increasing Teachers' Self-efficacy Through Regular Teaching and Learning Supervision," Universal Journal of Educational Research, 2020.

[15] L. M. H. Sanetti and H.-J. Luh, "Treatment Fidelity in School-Based Intervention," 2020.

[16] R. Lazarides and U. Schiefele, "The Relative Strength of Relations Between Different Facets of Teacher Motivation and Core Dimensions of Teaching Quality in Mathematics - A Multilevel Analysis," Learning and Instruction, 2021.

[17] R. T. Santiago, L. L. McIntyre, and S. A. Garbacz, "Dimensions of Family-school Partnerships for Autistic Children: Context and Congruence," School Psychology (Washington, D.C.), 2021.

[18] M. Huda, "Analisis Faktor Kinerja Guru Untuk Meningkatkan Mutu Pendidikan Madrasah," Islamic Management: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam, 2022.