Experiences of Police Officers in Online Training Environment

Mustafa Bulent Halicioglu*

Ph.D., Turkish National Police, Turkey

Email: mbhalicioglu@gmail.com

Abstract

In this phenomenological qualitative study, the author attempts to identify what the police officers' perceptions of online training and whether they think that this kind of programs affect their job performance. Throughout the study, officers' negative and positive experiences in online learning environment are presented and possible contributors to negative experiences are identified. Furthermore, this study reveals what the perceptions of officers about online learning. End of the study, some advantages and disadvantages of online learning presented.

Keywords: Phenomenological study; online learning; police training.

1. Introduction

Developing technology has been affecting everything in human life. It is commonly accepted that the teaching and learning area is also one of those fields that are influenced by those technological developments. In this field, many different technologies have been used to support and facilitate teaching and learning activities. These are called education and training technologies [1, 2]. Nowadays, the internet is accepted as the most important and widely utilized education and training technology [3]. Using of internet or intranet to learn and teach is called online learning [4].

----

* Corresponding author.

Many educational sectors including universities, colleges, even high schools offer internet based online courses for their students in the world. Additionally, for approximately two decades, some public and government organizations, including the police, have also started to use the internet to provide training for their personnel. The main concern in this study is police training programs based on online learning principles. These training programs is called online training in this article.

The purpose of this study is to describe what the police officers' perceptions about online training and whether they think this kind of programs affect their job performance. In this article, online training refers to in-service training programs that organized through internet for the police officers. Specifically the author of this article intends to understand what is happening when the police officers learn online and to get into that in a very *phenomenological* way. That is, he wants to learn what was going on in their heads; what did they do when they were interactive with the computer during the online learning process; what did they learn when they did this study; what was they pulled out and put into their minds; whether their experiences in online learning environment were different from the experiences in traditional (face to face) learning environment; and whether what they learned in online learning have any effect on their works.

2. Review of Relevant Literature

In the modern world, because of the sociological, technological, political changes and very creative innovations, the importance of training has been understood by most organizations. To cope with new technological challenges, to increase quality and productivity of their products, to continue their power, and even to subsist, many organizations focus on training or re-training of their personnel [5].Those organizations also demand their workers to be loaded with the skills that can help to reach their targets and to struggle with marketing or competitive challenges [6]. In addition to technological innovations and marketing competitive, sociological trends, political reforms, and changes in organizational perspectives also force the organizations to train and retrain their personnel. For example, new laws and regulations require that organizations provide training about these issues to their personnel. Recently, organizations commonly choose distance learning (especially online learning) technologies in order to give regular, worldwide training, to reduce delivery cycle time, to increase learner convenience, to reduce information overload, to improve tracking, and to decrease expenses [7]. This sentence refers to advantages of online learning.

Looking literature, we encounter five advantages of online learning. These are cost advantage, worldwide learning and training, convenience, accessibility, and flexibility [8-12]. Convenience generally includes time and place convenience. That is, learners can join online learning classes whenever and where ever they want [12]. Instructors also have some convenience due to online learning. For example, online learning increases instructors' ability to track learner activities and mastery of material through online exams, quizzes, learner profile, etc. [7]. In terms of flexibility, through online learning, flexible programs can be provided and offered to the learners with different learning levels or with different individual needs [11]. Online learning is also accessible; it provides opportunities for the learners to access other resources, materials, and subject experts in an easy way [11,12]. Because of reduced-cost and high-rate of data transmission ability of computer and internet technologies, it has also become more accessible to a wider population [9]. In terms of its worldwide training

advantage, online learning is especially important for big public and private organizations which have a lot of sub-units and personnel working in different parts of the country and world. Since there is not any limitation in terms of instructor and classroom capacity, more people can be trained simultaneously and in less time through online learning. The other potential advantage of online learning is cost. Actually, initial development of an online learning class is generally more expensive than the classroom training [7, 13]. However, after the development of the online learning class, it is cheaper than classic classroom learning if courses are repeated several time, if a lot of learners attend the courses, if learners work or live in different places [7].

Literature also mentions about the disadvantages of online learning. The first mentioned disadvantage of the online learning is *lack of interaction*. Direct interaction between student and teacher observed generally in face-to-face classes is very beneficial and important in a learning environment [14]. However, especially for asynchronous online classes, interaction with peers and instructor may be low. Some believe that lack of interaction decreases the attractiveness of online learning [as cited in: 7]. Another disadvantage of online learning is *readiness for online learning*. This refers to lack of computer and internet knowledge and skills (at least basic level) [2]. That is, if participants of online learning programs are not ready for this learning environment, if they do not have some level computer and internet knowledge, they may experience difficulty. In addition, s*ecurity problems* relevant to the internet [12], *hidden costs* including the expense of infrastructure and routine maintenance [8], *limit to accessibility* to a particular technological platform, computer, or internet [9, 15], and *lack of support and services* providing tutors, academic planners/schedulers, and technical assistance [2] are also seen as the main disadvantages of the online learning.

It is clear that police officers are adult learners and adults' learning abilities or ways are different from youth or children [16,17]. Also, since it offers high independency, productivity, and new experiences, online learning provides opportunity to the participants in order for managing and controlling their learning process [18]. Similarly, because of their self-directedness, adult learners have autonomy and independency in learning environment, they can take initiative and responsibility of their learning [19]. Therefore, it can be assumed that online learning completely consistent with adult learning. We can wonder whether training programs through online learning are effective for police officers as adult learners or whether they can be trained effectively by using online training methods. Research shows that adults also can be trained by using online learning materials. For example, Brown found that after pre-test and post-test, manufacturing workers improved their knowledge via intranet-delivered course [20].

Also, another important point about online learning is whether its learning outcomes better than classroom or face-to-face learning. Research on effectiveness of online learning found mixed results. Whereas some studies' results showed that classic classroom learning more effective [14], some studies found opposite of this [10, 15]. There are also some studies which did not find any significant differences between online and classroom learning [21]. In terms of police training, Janniro compared the computer based learning and classic classroom learning. Results of this study showed that police officers learned basic materials related with their job more effectively via computer than classic classroom training [as cited in:7]. On the other side, Jang attempted to provide information about the status of in service training of law enforcement agencies in Texas, and he assessed opinion about not only online learning but also about all distance learning methods for in-service

training [22]. Using survey method, Jang asked questions to 47 law enforcement agencies' staffs about in-service training policies, cost problems, training priorities, and opinions about distance learning methods for in-service training of officers. The survey results indicated that law enforcement officers' perceptions about distance and online learning was negative. They believed that traditional methods were better than online learning [22]. Finally, Schmeecke, Pyne and her friends did not find any significant difference between online in-service training and traditional training at the end of their research [23, 24].

In addition to success of online learning, literature also focus on computer skills of online learners. It is well known that in police organizations, computer levels of all officers are different. Whereas some officers use computers and new technologies perfectly, some don't know more about computer technologies. Studies revealed that there is an association between the lower learning outcomes and the lower level computer self-efficacy in computer based or internet-based learning environments [25]. In another study, although results showed that learners had positive and significant satisfaction with online learning environment, these perceptions were influenced by learners' use of technology and their computer skills [15].

3. Research Questions

In this study, in order to understand essence of the online training courses for the police officers, answers will be sought for these questions:

- What do the police officers' experiences in the online training environment?
- How do the police officers define online training?
- What is the perception of the officers about effectiveness of online training?

4. Method

4.1. Research Design and Procedure

This study was done in a Police department in Michigan State, U.S. in 2008. The author made connection with a lieutenant working in that department and got permission for the study. A room in the department was provided in order for achieving the interview in an effective and comfortable manner. The interviewees were defined by the lieutenant regarding whether they have participated in any online training program. The author visited the department two different times for interview. In the first visit, the author did three interviews and in the second visit two interviews were done with the officers. When the author arrived the interview site, consent of each participants were obtained through consent form. In terms of recording procedure, during the interviewing process, a pre-designed form as a protocol was used in order to record information collected. This protocol helped to organize thoughts on items such as headings, information about starting the interview, concluding ideas, information on ending the interview, and thanking the respondent [26]. This protocol also included five open-ended questions. These questions were:

- Have you ever taken an online course related to your job? Can you tell me what was it?
- Why did you attend this online training program? What was your aim?

- What were your experienced in that program? What happened? Positive or Negative?
- What was the change in your professional life after taking this training program?
- Comparing the other face to face training programs how were the online training program, effective or not?

Each of the questions also had some sub-questions in order to understand participants' experiences deeply. In this process, the author tried to apply bracketing (epoche). In phenomenology, to understand a phenomenon at a deeper level, it is important that the researcher transcends or suspends past knowledge and experiences [26]. It is not surprised that the author also had some experiences with online learning, and it was necessary to bracket those experiences during this research process.

4.2. Sample

In terms of sample size for a phenomenological study, literature suggests five to twenty-five participants [26-29]. Dukes also claimed that there is no need large number of sampling for phenomenological research, they can be done with three, five or ten participants [30]. Therefore, a purposive sample of three male and two female police officers who had experience in any online training program related to their occupation participated in this phenomenological study. In Table 1, the general descriptive statistics of the participants are shown.

Table 1: Descriptive statistics of the participants

Number of the Participants	Age*	Sex	Race	Rank
1	31	F	White	Officer
2	42	M	White	Officer
3	34	M	White	Officer
4	43	F	White	Officer
5	44	M	White	Lieutenant

*Mean=39, SD=5.27

It is seen that all the respondents were white. Most of them were officers; only one of them was ranked officer (lieutenant). Ratio of the female officers to male officers is 2/3; that is, 40% officers were female. Average age was 39 years with standard deviation 5.27.

4.4. Data Analysis

A phenomenological method was used to analyze the all interviewees' transcripts. In phenomenological studies, researchers attempt to understand people's experiences about a phenomena [26, 31]. That is, in a phenomenological study, the main focus point is a phenomena, an event or a concept experienced by individuals

[32]. To facilitate the analyzing process in this phenomenological study, the author used NVivo 8 computer-based qualitative research program. In order to get an overall feeling about the all written transcripts, all of them were read several times. All the significant phrases or sentences that pertained to the lived experiences of online training programs that participants had attended were identified from each transcript. Then, the author formulated meanings from these statements and frames and clustered them into themes. At the end of the data analysis, the author attempted to integrate all the results into an exhaustive description of the online training and its effects on police officers' works or effectiveness.

The most important issue in this process was validity. Validity depends on trustworthiness and external reviews, and it is the outcome goal of a research [33]. It is clear that validation can be done multiple sources of information such as observations, interviews, official records, etc. However, in this study, the interviews were only used as a source of information. Therefore, this may be accepted as limitation of this study. However, in terms of establishing validity, the author tried not to influence the contents of the respondents' description in such a way that they did not reflect the respondents' actual experiences. To achieve this, standardized questions and probe questions were provided. The author also tried to make transcription accurate. In this article, the author also establish inductive validity at the end of the study. That is, it is clear that the other way in establishing validity is to examine theory and research related to the topic of the study. This kind of validity will be done at the conclusion of the study.

5. Results

From five verbatim transcripts, significant statements were extracted and their meanings were defined. Then the formulated meanings were arranged into clusters. These clusters resulted in 13 (thirteen) main themes, and each main theme had its sub themes. Table 2 shows all main themes of this study.

Table 2: Main themes of the study

Themes Affecting the Phenomenon	Themes Related the Respondents and Online Courses
1-Experiences (Negative or Positive)	1-Demographic Characteristics of respondents
2-Effectiveness Of Online Training (Perception)	2-Motivation of Respondents
3-Effectiveness of Online Training (Real)	3-Level of Computer Knowledge
4-Advantages of Online Training	4-Length of the Course
5-Disadvantages of Online Training	5-Topic of the Course
6-For whom Online Training is Good	6-When the respondents took the courses
7-For whom Online Training would not work	

Experiences: As it is mentioned in introduction part, one of the goals of this phenomenological study is to understand what is happening when the police officers learn online. That is, what were their experiences in online courses? The experiences theme in this study contains three sub themes: negative experiences, positive

experiences, and contributions of experiences. Result of the analysis showed that three officers had negative experiences in online training programs in which they participated. Two of them were female and older than 40 years old. All of them indicated that they had to attend those courses. Some of the negative experiences of the officers were fear of computer, concentration problems, learning nothing, and topic problems. At the end of the examinations of the interviews, four important contributor or issues related to negative experience of officers in online learning environment were identified. These are:

- Issues related to job
- Lack of computer knowledge
- Lack of discussion in online learning environment
- And learning style of officers

Issues related to job refers to requirements or characteristics of policing duties (such as workload, press of supervisor etc.) and caused somebody feels negative experience in online learning. One of the officers said "Because I was working in night job and I became tired, then sitting on chair for a period of time for online course stimulated some negative feelings." Because only one officer had lack of computer knowledge, it is seen that there is no much more association between level of computer knowledge and negative experience in matrix analysis conducted via NVivo 8. However, according to interviews, it was clearly understood that lack of computer knowledge is very important contributor to negative experience in online learning environment. The officer who had low level computer knowledge said:

"I would be one of those people who has lack of computer knowledge because when I went to high school there were no computers; also in the college. To have computer training was brand new to me and I am not profession or experienced on it. So, I had hard time (negative experiences) when I took that course because they were using terms that people 10 or 20 years younger than me had grown up with. When someone says 'double click on the mouse', I didn't know what they meant. When somebody said to do this I didn't know what they were talking about because they were using computer language that I wasn't familiar with. I was like the most basic computer knowledge. While many people hear, play video games, my computer experience was just using my ATM card. This problem did not affect the understanding the topic but it was just being afraid of computer. I was afraid that I am going to delete something, or I'm going to do something to make the computer to blow up on me 'I am going to lose information'."

Lack of discussion refers that people do not find opportunity to talk about the topic with peers or asking question to the instructor when they do not understand something. That is, there was lack of interaction. Because this problem is also seen as a disadvantage of the online training environment, it will be examined comprehensively during the discussion of advantages and disadvantages of online learning. The last and one of the most important issues related to negative experience is learning style of officers. This means online learning is not suitable method for some officers because they cannot learn efficiently in online environment. For example, one officer said:

"Because of my learning style, this negative affect may have occurred. Some people learn by hearing, some

learn by seeing, some learn by doing or reading; but I cannot learn by reading…I don't learn very well from readings. They were not good learning stuff for me."

Beside negative experiences there are also positive experiences of police officers in online training programs, and it should be said that negative and positive experience are not mutually exclusive. That is, same person may have had both positive and negative experiences in a course. Some positive experiences of police officers in online training programs are learning something, easiness of online courses, and learning on learner's own pace. For some of the respondents, online course were generally intro level and they also did not require more computer knowledge. Therefore, they defined those courses as easy. Some other said, in terms of positive experience, they learned something from these courses. But, the most important positive experience of police officers was that they learned on their own pace. One of them said "It was positive. Because you can learn on your own pace, you can stop, do something else came back to do it. You don't have to sitting in the classroom."

Effectiveness of Online Training: effectiveness of online training is assessed in this study under two main themes. These are perceived effectiveness of online training and the real effectiveness of online training. In terms of perceived effectiveness of online training, the author attempted to understood what the officers think about the effectiveness of the online course that they attended, and generally effectiveness of online training comparing with the traditional (face to face, or classroom) training. Specifically, for the training programs that they participated in, a thumping majority of officers said that online learning is less effective, and if somebody had come and told that course in class, they would have preferred class training instead of online. For example one of them said:

"If somebody came into the department and thought this course, I would prefer the face to face class because of interaction and learning experiences of others and instructor. You have written material, you have teacher speaking, you have other officers asking questions. It is just a more whole way of training."

On the other hand, only one respondent said that he would have preferred online course because he believed that online course was more effective than traditional course for that topic. He said:

"I like online course for that topic. I like to be or have material there (in computer); reference materials. You don't have to remember all of them; you can go back and refresh yourselves. Because of time issues (you enter when you want), and place issues (you can do at home or work), I prefer online. I like the reference material."

However, when the officers were asked what they think about the effectiveness of online course generally, they found online course neither more effective nor equally effective. According to them, online course were either less effective or had conditional effectiveness. One of them summarized why they find online learning less effective comparing with traditional learning:

"I say probably that overall the online learning is less effective because people generally don't spend much time on the online. There is no interaction for the instructor to know if you are getting the main points or not. For example, in online generally they ask you multiple questions…I think you still might be missing the bigger picture. Loosing big picture could be the problem."

In terms of real effectiveness of online learning, during the interviews, the author tried to understand whether the online training programs had affected officers' success, job, or proficiency. Four of five interviewees indicated that those courses affected both their success and job or proficiency positively. For example one of the respondent said

"In terms of success, sure; I was able to better understand to how to address go through what was expected of me from my supervisors after going through out of it." The other said "In terms of success, I think that I have more knowledge for how to use it, and I feel comfort when I use this spray. So this can be accepted as a little bit increase in my success."

It is understood that officers think that at the end of those courses, a little bit their knowledge increased; therefore, this increase may have affected their success positively. Regarding the effect of online training on his job and proficiency, one of the respondents said:

"For me, I enjoy teaching the police, and I think that being able to be certificated in online course makes job more fun. Instead of going out to traffic or doing other routine things that the other officers do, I am doing the job I like; I am training the officers. Without taking certificate through this online course I can't teach."

Advantages and Disadvantages of Online Learning: Some advantages and disadvantages of online learning have been already mentioned in the literature. Findings of this study are also consistently with previous studies. However, there are a few new results. Defining the advantages and disadvantages of the online learning from perspectives of police officers can help us to understand the essence of the online learning phenomena.

In terms of advantages of online learning, approximately all the respondents mentioned convenience as an advantages. They defined convenience differently. Overall, the result showed five different type of conveniences for the training program organized via online. These are:

- You don't have to be away from family in order to attend a training program,
- Cost advantage; you or your department does not have to pay much more money for your food, travel, accommodation etc.
- Place comfort; you can take the course where you want (home, work, etc.)
- Time comfort; you can take the course when you want.
- Travel; you don't have to travel to different city or states to participate a training program.

One of the respondents summarized some of these items above:

"It was much more convenient than going to another State to take this course. For example, if I were supposed to go to school, I would have to go to the Illinois because school is there. Therefore, I would have to travel, be away from my family, the department would have to pay for hotel, and my daily routine would change because I weren't in the city. So being online is more convenient."

Another said;

"In terms of online learning, it was good because it was convenient for the user; any time I wanted to do it, I could do. Within sixty days, when I wanted to get this course I could."

In addition to convenience some other advantages of online learning were defined as results of this study. These are:

- Ability to reach a lot of people: through online learning you can reach a lot of people all over the world at the same time.
- Learners do not have to read all text books and memorize them.
- It is easy.
- You can learn on your own pace. According to one respondent, "…you can stop, do something else came back to do it. You didn't have to sitting in the classroom."
- Shorter: Generally online training programs are short comparing the traditional training programs.
- You can do what you want. That is, you do not have to read or listen the entire lesson, you can quickly skim it.

In terms of disadvantages of the online learning, five items were defined as the results of this qualitative research. These are:

- Lack of interaction
- Missing big picture
- Not encompass everything
- Stressful
- Tiring

Lack of interaction is the most important and the most mentioned disadvantages of the online learning in the literature. All the respondents emphasized the importance of interaction with peers and teachers in a learning environment. And they said that online learning cannot provide this interaction. One of the respondents said:

"Online training just not the most effective way of learning for me because I don't have interaction back and forth, and as a person, I want interaction; I don't want to be meeting in a computer screen…it doesn't allow you ask any questions. So, if you say what if this happens, you are talking to computer screen, and computer screen doesn't give answer to question or it takes a couple days."

The other disadvantage of online learning is that because the lessons may not cover everything and you cannot ask question during the course period, you might be missing the big picture. On the other side, one respondent mentioned that comparing the classroom training, online learning did not cover everything. Another respondent said that if you weren't familiar with the computer and internet, it might be stressful for you.

For Whom Online Training is Good / For Whom Online Training would not Work: Furthermore, during the interview, the respondents were also asked for whom online training is good or would not work. The result

shows that officers think that online training is good for younger. For example, one police officer said:

"I think that the younger taking the class benefits more because younger have more proficiency with computers. They are also able to comprehend things better. For younger, online training may be more effective."

On the other hand, overall results show that online learning would not work for those who do not have interest to the topic presented by course; who do not have previous information about topic; who has barrier to access to computer; and who has lack of computer knowledge.

6. Discussion and Conclusion

Results of this study showed that police officers had both negative and positive experiences in online learning environment. Some negative experiences of police officers are fear of computer, concentration problems, learning nothing, and topic problems. Contributors to these negative experiences were defined as issues related to job, lack of computer knowledge, lack of discussion in online learning environment, and learning style of officers. Effectiveness of online training was examined under two main themes in this study: perceived effectiveness and real effectiveness. In terms of perceived effectiveness, officers overwhelmingly emphasized that online learning was less effective comparing the traditional learning. However, they also mentioned that in some condition online learning would be effective; however, they still preferred traditional learning instead of online. This result is consistent with the previous research. For example, in his study, Jang also showed that law enforcement officer' perception about distance and online learning was negative [22]. They believed that traditional methods were better than online learning [22].

In terms of real effectiveness of online learning, during the interviews, it was tried to understand whether the online training programs had affected officers' success, job, or proficiency. Results revealed that online training affected a little bit both the officers' success and job or proficiency positively. Although literature presents mixed results for effectiveness of online learning, these results support those whose findings were in favor of online learning.

In this study, some advantages and disadvantages of online learning were defined. Some advantages are convenience, cost advantage, place comfort, time comfort, ability to reach a lot of learner, easiness, learning on learner's own pace, and being short. Furthermore, learners who take online course do not have to be away from their family, do not have to travel to different city or states to participate a training program, and do not have to read all text books and memorize them. As mentioned above, literature presents five advantages of online learning: cost advantage, worldwide learning and training, convenience, accessibility, and flexibility [8-12]. Results of this study are consistent with the previous research. Only two advantages we may talk as the different finding of this study: easiness and shortness of online learning. On the other hand, as disadvantages of the online learning, five items were identified. These are lack of interaction, missing big picture, not encompass everything, stressful, and tiring. When we look at previous research, it can be seen that most of them presents lack of interaction as one of the important disadvantages of online learning. This study is also consistent with the literature. However this study differently found that in online learning environment police officers

experienced problem of missing big picture, feeling stress and tiredness.

The most important limitation of this study is generalizability. Like the other phenomenological studies, because of purposive sampling and small number of sample size, generalization of the results to the population is problematic. However, in spite of limitation of generalizability, this phenomenological research provides very valuable information about the experiences of the police officers in online training environment. Future research should examine officers' experiences in online training environment in a more quantitative way in order to figure out if there is any relationship between characteristics or attribution of officers and their success in this learning environment. They should also use more representative sample in order for generalizability.

References

[1] A. T. Bates. Technology, e-learning and distance education: Routledge, 2005.

[2] J. M. Galusha. "Barriers to learning in distance education," An Electronic Journal for the 21st Century, vol. 5, pp. 6-14, 1997.

[3] D. E. Gray. "The Internet in lifelong learning: liberation or alienation?," International Journal of Lifelong Education, vol. 18, pp. 119-126, 1999.

[4] G. Kearsley. Online learning: Personal reflections on the transformation of education: Educational Technology, 2005.

[5] A. Gladstone and M. Ozaki. Working together: labour-management co-operation in training and in technological and other changes vol. 76: International Labour Organization, 1991.

[6] S. D. Mastrofski and R. R. Ritti. "Police training and the effects of organization on drunk driving enforcement," Justice Quarterly, vol. 13, pp. 291-320, 1996.

[7] E. T. Welsh, C. R. Wanberg, K. G. Brown, and M. J. Simmering. "E-learning: emerging uses, empirical results and future directions," International Journal of Training and Development, vol. 7, pp. 245-258, 2003.

[8] J. Killion. "Online Staff Development: Promise or Peril?," NASSP bulletin, vol. 84, pp. 38-46, 2000.

[9] M. J. Murphy, R. F. Levant, J. E. Hall, and R. L. Glueckauf. "Distance education in professional training in psychology," Professional Psychology: Research and Practice, vol. 38, p. 97, 2007.

[10] T. Sitzmann, K. Kraiger, D. Stewart, and R. Wisher. "The comparative effectiveness of web-based and classroom instruction: A meta-analysis," Personnel psychology, vol. 59, pp. 623-664, 2006.

[11] G. Thornbory. "E-learning: The revolution," Occupational Health, vol. 55, pp. 23-25, 2003.

[12] B. K. Trombley and D. Lee. "Web-based Learning in Corporations: who is using it and why, who is not and why not?," Journal of Educational Media, vol. 27, pp. 137-146, 2002.

[13] P. Thomas, L. Carswell, B. Price, and M. Petre. "A holistic approach to supporting distance learning using the Internet: transformation, nottranslation," British Journal of Educational Technology, vol. 29, pp. 149-161, 1998.

[14] B. W. Brown and C. E. Liedholm. "Can web courses replace the classroom in principles of microeconomics?," The American Economic Review, vol. 92, pp. 444-448, 2002.

[15] D. K. Creedy, M. Mitchell, P. Seaton–Sykes, M. Cooke, E. Patterson, C. Purcell, et al.. "Evaluating a Web–Enhanced Bachelor of Nursing Curriculum: Perspectives of Third–Year Students," Journal of nursing education, vol. 46, 2007.

[16] M. Knowles. "The adult learner: a neglected species," Houston, TX: Gulf Publishing, 1990.

[17] S. Merriam, R. Caffarella, and L. Baumgartner. Learning in adulthood: a comprehensive guide, 3rd ed. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 2007.

[18] K. P. King. "Course development on the world wide web," New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education, vol. 1998, pp. 25-32, 1998.

[19] M. Knowles. Self—Directed Learning: A Guidefor Learners and Teachers Nueva York: Cambridge: The Adult Education Company, 1975.

[20] K. G. Brown. "Using computers to deliver training: Which employees learn and why?," Personnel Psychology, vol. 54, pp. 271-296, 2001.

[21] Y. Zhao, J. Lei, B. Yan, C. Lai, and S. Tan. "What makes the difference? A practical analysis of research on the effectiveness of distance education," The Teachers College Record, vol. 107, pp. 1836-1884, 2005.

[22] H. Jang. "In-service training and distane learning," TELEMASP Bulletin, vol. 12, pp. 1-7, 2005.

[23] J. M. Schmeeckle. "Online training: An evaluation of the effectiveness and efficiency of training law enforcement personnel over the Internet," Journal of Science Education and Technology, vol. 12, pp. 205-260, 2003.

[24] M. Pyne, L. A. Brady, E. R. Goeres, E. A. Jones, and J. J. Nolan. The Efficacy of Web-based Training Versus Face-to-face Instruction in Learning Hate Crime Identification and Scoring in the Criminal Justice Environment: West Virginia University Libraries, 2002.

[25] J. J. Martocchio. "Effects of conceptions of ability on anxiety, self-efficacy, and learning in training,"

Journal of applied psychology, vol. 79, pp. 819-825, 1994.

[26] J. Creswell. "Qualitative inquiry and research method: Choosing among five approaches," ed: Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 2007.

[27] B. Mawn. "Raising a child with HIV: An emerging phenomenon," Families, Systems, & Health, vol. 17, p. 197, 1999.

[28] D. E. Polkinghorne. "Phenomenological research methods," in Existential-phenomenological perspectives in psychology, ed: Springer, 1989, pp. 41-60.

[29] M. X. Zamarripa, I. Lane, E. Lerma, and L. Holin. "Self-Knowledge and Identity in a Mexican American Counseling Course: A Qualitative Exploration," Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences, vol. 33, pp. 88-104, 2011.

[30] S. Dukes. "Phenomenological methodology in the human sciences," Journal of religion and health, vol. 23, pp. 197-203, 1984.

[31] M. Dowling. "From Husserl to van Manen. A review of different phenomenological approaches," International journal of nursing studies, vol. 44, pp. 131-142, 2007.

[32] A. Guler, M. B. Halicioglu, and S. Tasgin. "Sosyal bilimlerde nitel arastirma yontemleri-Qualitative research methods in social science" Ankara: Seckin Yayincilik, 2013.

[33] E. H. Anderson and M. H. Spencer. "Cognitive representations of AIDS: a phenomenological study," Qualitative Health Research, vol. 12, pp. 1338-1352, 2002.